# Parameter identification of continuum models for localized failure

C. Iacono & L. J. Sluys

Faculty of Civil Engineering & Geosciences, Delft University of Technology. Delft, The Netherlands.

ABSTRACT: The parameter identification problem of the gradient-enhanced continuum damage model is solved using tools of the inverse problems theory. Particularly, the K-Nearest Neighbors (KNN) technique and the Kalman Filter (KF) method are adopted in cascade to identify the length scale parameter and the parameter governing the softening branch of the material constitutive law. Two experimental data series are used, concerning different sizes and loading conditions, in order to investigate the influence of the involved experimental data in the parameter estimates and the predictive capabilities of the considered model. The inverse problem results to be ill-posed if only force-deformation data are used in the parameter identification procedure. Additional data related to the evolution of the width of the damaged zone during the fracture process are adopted in order to recover the well-posedness of the inverse problem.

## 1 INTRODUCTION

In the last three decades there has been an increasing interest in the study of the tensile behavior of concrete or, more generally, of quasi-brittle materials, in order to numerically simulate the strain localization process responsible for macroscopic fracture phenomena. However, the different computational models developed for this purpose contain some model parameters (constants) that cannot be directly measured during laboratory tests. For those model parameters the solution of an inverse problem is required, which can provide the parameter estimates by minimizing, iteratively, the discrepancy between experimental and computational data. This is the case, for instance, for the length scale parameter and the slope of the softening branch of the material constitutive law of the gradient-enhanced continuum damage model, on which the present paper focuses. Different issues of the parameter identification procedure are investigated, as for instance the well-posedness of the inverse problem and the predictive capabilities of the calibrated model in terms of size and geometry effects. For this purpose, the K-Nearest Neighbors (KNN) technique associated with the Kalman Filter (KF) method is adopted. Experimental data from uniaxial tensile tests and three point bending tests of different specimen sizes are used.

# 2 COMPUTATIONAL MODEL

The adopted computational model (for a complete treatment see Peerlings (1999)) is based on the

isotropic continuum damage formulation of Lemaitre and Chaboche (1990), containing a damage scalar variable  $\omega$  responsible for the degradation of the elastic properties of the material according to the following classical stress-strain relation

$$\boldsymbol{\sigma} = (1 - \omega) \boldsymbol{D}^{el} \boldsymbol{\varepsilon} \tag{1}$$

in which  $D^{el}$  is the matrix of the undamaged ( $\omega = 0$ ) elastic stiffness moduli. The damage process is driven by the modified von Mises definition of the equivalent strain  $\varepsilon_{eq}$  (Vree et al. 1995), that after reaching a certain strain threshold triggers the damage evolution law. The model is regularized through the introduction of a nonlocal equivalent strain  $\overline{\varepsilon}_{eq}(\boldsymbol{x})$  as an average quantity of the local counterpart  $\varepsilon_{eq}(\boldsymbol{x})$  on a certain radius of the material point that is governed by a model parameter l, referred to as the length scale. Hence, the following diffusion equation (implicit gradient formulation) is added to the material constitutive laws

$$\bar{\varepsilon}_{eq} - c\nabla^2 \bar{\varepsilon}_{eq} = \varepsilon_{eq} \tag{2}$$

where c is the so-called gradient parameter, which can be related to the length scale parameter ( $c = l^2/2$ ). The described model contains seven model parameters to be identified (Iacono et al. 2006a): Young's modulus, Poisson's ratio, the tensile and compressive strengths of the material, the gradient parameter c and two parameters  $\beta$  and  $\alpha$  governing, respectively, the negative slope and the tail of the softening branch of the material constitutive law. For computing time reasons, the parameters identification procedure presented in this paper focuses on c and  $\beta$ , considering the remaining parameters as a priori known.

## 3 INVERSE PROBLEM

Solving the forward problem means to find analytical or numerical solutions for the ordinary or partial differential equations of the model, with known initial and boundary conditions and constants (or parameters) in the equations. On the contrary, in the inverse problem the solution is known and the objective is to determine the complete forward problem for which that solution is possible.

## 3.1 Inverse problems in experimental-numerical research

Once a numerical model can provide qualitatively acceptable output, in comparison with the real responses of the described system, a rigorous estimation of the model parameters is needed, in order to reproduce quantitatively correct output.

Let S be the real mechanical system represented by a numerical model containing model parameters assembled in a vector **x**. If a perturbation is applied on S, the system reacts giving a certain response representable by a certain number of quantities measured at different 'instants' t and collected in a  $\mathbf{y}_{exp}^t$  vector. On the other hand, the numerical model of the system, given the model parameter vector **x**, is able to compute the solution of the forward problem  $\mathbf{y}_{comp}^t$ , as the corresponding computational counterpart of  $\mathbf{y}_{exp}^t$ . The correct estimate of the model parameters vector **x** may be obtained using inverse techniques, which, starting from an initial guess of the model parameters  $\mathbf{x}_0$ , minimize a function  $f(\mathbf{x})$  (objective function) of the discrepancy between  $\mathbf{y}_{exp}^t$  and  $\mathbf{y}_{comp}^t$ 

$$f(\mathbf{x}) = (\mathbf{y}_{exp}^t - \mathbf{y}_{comp}^t(\mathbf{x}), \mathbf{x}_0)$$
(3)

This calibration phase of the model development represents a first check for the model. In fact, for instance, the solution of the inverse problem might not exist or it might be unstable. The identification of the sources of error may require a significant effort, since causes of ill-posedness might not only be found in the model, but also in the type of experimental data used for the calibration (quality, quantity and type of data) or in the adopted inverse method (for instance, local search techniques might stick into local minima of the objective function).

Hence, the inverse analysis might reveal limits in the basic assumptions of the model. A 'proof ab absurdo' of the model can be provided by the inverse analysis: starting from the hypothesis that the way the model describes the physical process is correct, possible flaws might be found, that lead to re-discuss the hypotheses, which give input for model improvements.

However, for a rigorous model assessment various real situations needed to be considered, *different* from the one(s) used for the model calibration. Forward problems are solved and comparisons between the experimental and computational responses are performed. Hence, limits related to the predictive capacities and to the applicability of the model can be provided, in order to have a model as a valid tool for design, monitoring, and prediction problems.

If, on one hand, experimental data may be used for qualitative and quantitative updating of the numerical model, on the other hand, the numerical model may be a useful tool for the optimal experiment design (several criteria and methods are available (Emery and Nenarokomov 1998)). For instance, numerical simulations may lead to optimal choices for measurement set-up, regarding, for instance, number of sensors, their location, geometry and size of the specimen, boundary and loading conditions, duration of the experiment, etc. Hence, the continuous integration and interaction of model building with experimental testing allows not only the complete understanding of a real phenomenon, but also significant improvement of both experiments and numerical modelling. Within this framework, the Inverse Problems Theory can provide the tools to connect experimental and computational research.

## 3.2 Inverse techniques

The choice of the inverse technique is fundamental. More inverse techniques may be used, for instance in cascade, in order to optimize *effectiveness* (how close the estimation is to the exact solution), *efficiency* (time saving) and *robustness* (reliability or repeatability of the solution) of the method.

In the present work, two inverse techniques, briefly described below, are used in cascade, with different features, so that a compromise of local-global search tool is obtained: the K-Nearest Neighbors (KNN) method and the Kalman filter (KF) method.

The basic notions of their mathematical formulation are presented in Iacono et al. (2003), (2006a), while detailed treatments can be found in e.g. Kailath et al. (2000), Tarantola (1987), Bittanti et al. (1984), Catlin (1989), Bui (1994), Powell (1998). Here, it suffices to mention that, since the final solution may be strongly influenced by the starting point of the search process, the KNN method is proposed for a first preliminary study of the parameters space. In this way, possible ill-posedness of the inverse problem may be easily detected and promising search regions may be localized, speeding up the convergence of the inverse procedure and avoiding model parameter estimates representing local minima of the objective function. The KNN method is also suggested when a rough tuning of a model is required, because it may be easily handled (derivative free method) and implemented for any computational model (without changing the forward problem code, but as an external tool) and also by users that are not familiar with the inverse problem theory.

Successively, using the so-identified parameters vector as initial guess, the KF method is adopted in order to refine the inverse solution. The KF method takes into account also the uncertainties related to the experimental data and to the parameter estimates, offering also the advantage of a subsequent parameter update during the fracture process.

## 4 EXPERIMENTAL DATA

Two experimental data series, reported below, are used in the present paper.

## 4.1 Series no. 1

The series no. 1 is represented by tensile size effect tests on concrete dog-bone shaped specimens carried out in the Stevin laboratory of Delft University of Technology (van Vliet 2000), (van Vliet and van Mier 2000). The available experimental data are the *global* load-displacement curves for the various specimen sizes.

## 4.2 Series no. 2

This series consists of double-edge notched uniaxial tensile tests and single-edge notched bending tests on specimens made of the same concrete (Hariri 2000), (Hariri 2001). In this case, besides conventional measurement techniques such as using LVDTs, in-plane Electronic Speckle Pattern Interferometry (ESPI) is used leading to whole field displacements and strain distributions along the main sensitivity direction perpendicular to the notches. Hence, the available experimental data consist of global data (force vs. deformation curves) and local data (width of the fracture process zone vs. deformation curves) for the different specimen sizes and geometries (see Section 7). This data series allows a relevant investigation of four essential aspects: i) which kind of experimental data is necessary for the identifiability of the model parameters and the well-posedness of the inverse problem (local/global data), ii) how the estimated parameters are influenced by the experimental data involved in the inverse problem iii) the assessment of the reliability of the model predictions, in terms of loading conditions and size effects.

## 5 UNIQUENESS OF THE INVERSE SOLUTION

If only the force-deformation curve (global data) is considered and an approximation of the objective function of Eq. (3) is built, using the KNN method, a saddle shaped surface appears. This is shown in Figure 1a, for instance, in case of the dog-bone specimen type C of the experimental series no. 1. This means that the two model parameters  $\beta$  and c are correlated. The inverse problem is ill-posed, since no unique and/or stable solution is guaranteed. Hence, different parameter sets correspond to similar global force-deformation curves (Iacono et al. 2006a).

The well-posedness of the inverse problem is not recovered when the global data of different specimen sizes are considered, as shown in Figure 1b, being the coupling between the parameters c and  $\beta$  of a similar type for all sizes (Iacono et al. 2004), (Iacono et al. 2006a).

#### 6 SIZE EFFECT

The gradient-enhanced damage model seems to incorrectly reproduce the entire experimental size effect curve, using only one parameters set for all specimen sizes: the computational size effect curve remains too flat compared to the experimental one (Iacono et al. 2006b). By using a single parameter set for all specimen sizes and involving only global data, only an unstable average fitting of the size effect curve can be reached. In other words, different parameter sets can be found which correspond to slightly different computational size effect curves, representing an average fitting of the experimental curve. This is shown in Figure 2a for the case of the bending tests of the experimental series no. 2 (where the considered parameter set belongs to the saddle of the objective function  $f(\mathbf{x})$ ).

A better fit may be achieved considering a fixed value of  $\beta = 500$  and different values of the gradient parameter c, as shown in Figures 2b and 3.

#### 7 FPZ WIDTH

The width of the fracture process zone (FPZ), available in the experimental series no. 2, is used as additional information in order to solve the correlation between the two model parameters c and  $\beta$ .

However, the main difficulty is to establish a criterion in order to define the FPZ width d from a strain distribution. Experimentally, the use of in-plane Electronic Speckle Pattern Interferometry (ESPI) in the experimental series no. 2 provides whole field displacements and strain distributions along the main sensitivity direction perpendicular to the notches. Hence, the FPZ width is defined as the width of the area where the strain exceeds a certain threshold value, defined relatively to the peak value (in this case



Figure 1. (a) Objective function  $f_{\alpha=0.93}(\beta, c)$  for the type C dog-bone shaped specimen. (b) Force deformation curves for all dog-bone specimen sizes (A to E) for two equivalent parameter sets, set<sub>1</sub>=[ $c = 50 \text{ mm}^2 \beta = 1200$ ] and set<sub>2</sub>=[ $c = 20 \text{ mm}^2 \beta = 800$ ] ( $\alpha = 0.93$ ).



Figure 2. (a)Experimental and computational size effect curves for the single-edge notched bending specimens (BG1 to BG5 size) of the experimental series no. 2 (Hariri 2000), (Hariri 2001) ( $\alpha = 0.92$ ) (b) corresponding computational size effect curve. The stress-CMOD curves related to these parameter sets are shown in Figure 3 ( $\alpha = 0.92$ ).

20%). Widths of the FPZ are recorded during the entire fracture process, so that FPZ width vs. deformation curves are available for the experimental series no. 2.

Numerically, at each time step t, the nonlocal equivalent strain profile along the beam mid-height axis may be considered (alternatively, the damage profile or the local equivalent strain profile might be used). Hence, analogously to the experimental case, the computational value  $d_{\text{comp}}^t(\mathbf{x})$  may be defined as the width of the area where the nonlocal strain  $\bar{\varepsilon}_{eq}$  is larger than a certain fixed percentage (the same used during the experiments) of the peak value (see Figure 4).

It could be argued that this way of determining the FPZ width is arbitrary and debatable and that the final estimate of the model parameters vector is influenced by both the experimental technique adopted for the measurement of  $d_{exp}$  and the method and threshold value used for the definition of the numerical corresponding value  $d_{comp}$ . However, the essential aspect and requirement is that all coefficients, assumptions,

and procedures used for the calibration of the numerical model are kept constant and consistent for all specimens sizes and loading conditions, so that the predictive capacity of the model may be assessed. Therefore, the strain threshold value used for the definition of the FPZ width, which should be consistent with the experimental data, may be seen as a tuning parameter of the so-calibrated model.

Hence, the width of the damaged area d may be included in the definition of the objective function  $f(\mathbf{x})$  (Iacono et al. 2006a), according to

$$f(\mathbf{x}) = \sum_{j=1}^{n} p_1 f_{1\_sizej} + \sum_{j=1}^{n} p_2 f_{2\_sizej}, \qquad (4)$$

where  $f_{1\_sizej}$  and  $f_{2\_sizej}$  are the global and local contribution, respectively, related to the specimen size j. In Eq. (4),  $p_1$  and  $p_2$  are two weight factors with which the two contributions, global and local data, are taken into account (guidelines for the choice of their values are suggested in Iacono et al. (2006a)).

Hence, if only the global data or only the local data



Figure 3. Stress-CMOD curves for all BG specimen sizes of the experimental series no. 2 (Hariri 2000), (Hariri 2001) corresponding to fixed value of  $\beta = 500$  and variable gradient parameter (c = 50 for BG1, c = 20 for BG2, c = 70 for BG3, c = 30 for BG4 and c = 50 for BG5) ( $\alpha = 0.92$ ).



Figure 4. Nonlocal equivalent strain profile along the beam mid-height axis, used for the FPZ width definition d.

of all specimen sizes of the experimental series no. 2 are involved in the inverse problem, the objective function remains characterized by a saddle (see Figure 5a and b). Considering both global and local contributions, with unit weights ( $p_1 = p_2 = 1.0$ ), a single stable solution may be identified (see Figure 5c). Reducing the local data weight  $p_2$ , the area of possible solutions enlarges (see Figure 5d).

Considering a single parameter set for all specimen sizes, a computational range of variation for the FPZ width is produced (regarding to specimen size) that is smaller than the experimental one (see Figure 6). Hence, not only the size effect on the peak loads, but also the size effect on the FPZ width is badly captured by the adopted model, with a single parameter set.

Finally, the experimental series no. 2 is also considered for analysing global and local curves of different sizes and different structures. In this case, using a parameter set that provides an acceptable average fitting of the bending tests does not correspond to reliable model predictions for the tensile tests (Iacono et al. 2006b).

# 8 LENGTH SCALE

The unsatisfactory fitting of the experimental size effect curve provided by the examined model, with a single value of the length scale parameter, might be the consequence of different phenomena. Firstly, the considered numerical model is deterministic. Hence statistical influences in the size effect curve cannot be reproduced by the model. Moreover, the length scale parameter might depend not only on the initial undamaged microstructure, but also on all deformation mechanisms occurring during the damage process. These mechanisms change the microstructure in



Figure 5. Contourplot of the objective function  $f(\mathbf{x})$  of Eq. (4) considering all BG specimen sizes of the experimental series no. 2 (Hariri 2000) (Hariri 2001) and involving (a) only the global data (b) only the local data (c) global and local data with  $p_1 = 1.0$  and  $p_2 = 1.0$  (d) global and local data with  $p_1 = 1.0$  and  $p_2 = 0.2$  ( $\alpha = 0.92$ ).



Figure 6. FPZ width-CMOD curves for all BG specimen sizes of the experimental series no. 2 (Hariri 2000) (Hariri 2001) corresponding to the three parameter sets  $\mathbf{x}_1^T$ :  $[c = 80 \ \beta = 600]$ ,  $\mathbf{x}_2^T$ :  $[c = 60 \ \beta = 600]$  and  $\mathbf{x}_3^T$ :  $[c = 25 \ \beta = 350]$  ( $\alpha = 0.92$ ).

a progressive way. In other words, the length scale might not be constant during the entire fracture process, but it could be variable according to a suitable evolution law, for instance, in terms of cracking strain or damage variable, in a sort of self-adaptive strategy implemented at the level of the material constitutive law (Geers et al. 1999), (van Mier 2004), (Ferrara and di Prisco 2002), (Mosalam and Paulino 1997), (Pamin 1994). Finally, the unsatisfactory fitting might be the consequence of a series of possible sources of error (detailed discussion in Iacono et al. (2006b)) which are intrinsic deficiencies of the model or of the experimental methods and not all easily detectable and correctable.

On the other hand, considering the possibility of a length scale that depends on the specimen size or on the fracture process state not only invalidates the model assumption of constant material properties, but it also makes the inverse procedure for parameter identification more complex (a length scale function should be identified). Moreover, in this way, the use of the model for prediction purposes would be limited. In fact, the model calibrated on the basis of the experimental results of a certain specimen size or loading condition might provide unreliable predictions for other specimen sizes and loading conditions. Hence, the hypothesis of a size-dependent length scale is debatable and not easily accepted in the fracture mechanics research community.

## 9 CONCLUSIONS

The parameter identification problem of the gradient enhanced continuum damage model is analyzed in the present paper. The problem of extracting intrinsic material properties (constitutive parameters at the material point level) from measured experimental responses (combination of structural and material behavior) is considered. Two inverse techniques in cascade are adopted: the KNN method first, as a preliminary study of the parameters space and, subsequently, the KF method, as a more refined search tool.

The well-posedness, in terms of uniqueness and/or stability of the solution, of the inverse problem is investigated. Considering only the global force-displacement curve of one single specimen size, a correlation between the gradient parameter c and the slope of the softening branch of the stress-strain constitutive law  $\beta$  is obtained.

Involving the force-deformation curves of different specimen sizes does not solve the ill-posedness, since the direction of correlation between the two parameters is similar for the various specimen sizes.

If local data, such as the development of the width of the fracture process zone during the fracture process, are considered, the well-posedness may be recovered and a unique and stable solution may be obtained.

The limits of validity and of the predictive capacity of the calibrated model are investigated, considering possible structural influences on the parameters estimate, as consequence of the structural effects on the experimental data used in the identification process. The model seems to incorrectly reproduce the entire experimental size effect curve using only one parameters set for all specimen sizes. It leaves the computational size effect curve, as a whole, too flat compared to the experimental one: the real size effect curve may be fitted only in an average way.

Moreover, considering a single parameter set for all specimen sizes, a computational range of variation for the FPZ width is produced (regarding the specimen size) that is smaller than the experimental one. Hence, not only the size effect on the peak loads, but also the size effect on the FPZ width is badly captured by the adopted model with a single parameter set.

If different sizes and different structures (three point bending tests and uniaxial tensile tests) are considered, unsatisfactory predictions of the model are obtained with a single parameter set. In other words, a parameter set that provides an acceptable average fitting of the bending tests does not correspond to reliable model predictions for the tensile tests.

In conclusion, solving the inverse problem results to be a valid tool for the model assessment and the analysis of the weak points in the description of the forward problem.

# 10 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The program related to the implementation of the gradient-enhanced model in the framework of the finite element code FEAP was kindly supplied by A. Simone. The authors like to acknowledge M. R. A. van Vliet and K. Hariri for the experimental results and the Technical Science Foundation in the Netherlands (STW) for financial support to CI. The present paper is based on the doctoral thesis of CI (Iacono 2007).

# REFERENCES

- Bittanti, S., G. Maier, and A. Nappi (1984). Inverse problem in structural elastoplasticity: a kalman filter approach. In A. Sawczuk and G. Bianchi (Eds.), *Plasticity Today*, London, pp. 311–329. Elsevier Applied Science Publ.
- Bui, H. D. (1994). *Inverse Problem in the Mechanics of Materials: an Introduction*. London: CRC Press.
- Catlin, D. E. (1989). *Estimation, Control, and the Discrete Kalman Filter*. Berlin: Springer Verlag, Applied Mathematical Sciences.

- Emery, A. F. and A. V. Nenarokomov (1998). Optimal experiment design. *Measurement Science and Technology 9*, 864–876.
- Ferrara, L. and M. di Prisco (2002). A nonlocal approach with evolutionary internal length for the analysis of mode I fracture processes in concrete. In *15th ASCE Engineering Mechanics Conference, Columbia University, New York, NY*.
- Geers, M. G. D., R. D. Borst, and T. Peijs (1999). Mixed numerical-experimental identification of nonlocal characteristics of random-fibre-reinforced composites. *Composites Science and Technology* 59, 1569–1578.
- Hariri, K. (2000). Bruchmechanisches Verhalten jungen Betons, Laser-Speckle-Interferometrie und Modellierung der Rissprozesszone. Deutscher Ausschuss für Stahlbeton ISSN:0171-7197 509. Berlin : Beuth, ISBN 3-410-65709-6.
- Hariri, K. (2001). Fracture mechanics behaviour of concrete at early age. In *Improved Production* of Advanced Concrete Structures-IPACS. Department of Civil & Mining Engineering, Luleå University of Technology, Sweden.
- Iacono, C. (2007). Procedures for parameter estimates of computational models for localized failure. Ph. D. thesis, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands.
- Iacono, C., L. J. Sluys, and J. G. M. van Mier (2003, 17-20 March). Development of an inverse procedure for parameter estimates of numerical models. In N. Bićanić, R. Borst, H. A. Mang, and G. Meschke (Eds.), *Computational Modelling of Concrete Structures – EURO-C* 2003, pp. 259–268. Swets & Zeitlinger, Lisse.
- Iacono, C., L. J. Sluys, and J. G. M. van Mier (2004). Parameters identification of computation fracture models. In V. C. Li, C. K. Y. Leung, K. J. Willam, and S. L. Billington (Eds.), *Fracture Mechanics of Concrete Structures*, pp. 447–454.
- Iacono, C., L. J. Sluys, and J. G. M. van Mier (2006a). Estimation of model parameters in nonlocal damage theories by inverse analysis techniques. *Computer Methods in Applied Mechanics and Engineering 195*, 7211–7222.
- Iacono, C., L. J. Sluys, and J. G. M. van Mier (2006b, March). Parameters identification of a nonlocal continuum damage model. In H. M. G. Meschke, R. De Borst and N. Bićanić (Eds.), *Computational Modelling of Concrete Structures – EURO-C 2006*, pp. 353 – 362. A.A. Balkema.

- Kailath, T., A. H. Sayed, and B. Hassibi (2000). *Linear Estimation*. London: Prentice Hall.
- Lemaitre, J. and J.-L. Chaboche (1990). *Mechanics of Solid Materials*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Mosalam, K. M. and G. H. Paulino (1997). Evolutionary characteristic length method for smeared cracking finite element models. *Finite Elements in Analysis and Design 27*, 99–108.
- Pamin, J. (1994). Gradient-dependent plasticity in numerical simulation of localization phenomena. Ph. D. thesis, Delft University of Technology.
- Peerlings, R. H. J. (1999). *Enhanced Damage Modelling for Fracture and Fatigue*. Ph. D. thesis, Eindhoven University of Technology, The Netherlands.
- Powell, M. J. D. (1998). Direct search algorithms for optimization calculations. Acta Numerica 7, 287–336.
- Tarantola, A. (1987). *Inverse Problem Theory. Methods for Data Fitting and Model Parameter Estimation*. Southampton: Elsevier Applied Science.
- van Mier, J. G. M. (2004). Reality behind fictitious cracks? In V. C. Li, C. K. Y. Leung, K. J. Willam, and S. L. Billington (Eds.), *Fracture Mechanics of Concrete Structures*, pp. 11–30.
- van Vliet, M. R. A. (2000). Size Effect in Tensile Fracture of Concrete and Rock. Ph. D. thesis, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands.
- van Vliet, M. R. A. and J. G. M. van Mier (2000). Experimental investigation of size effect in concrete and sandstone under uniaxial tension. *Engineering Fracture Mechanics* 65 (2/3), 165–188.
- Vree, J. H. P., W. A. M. Brekelmans, and M. A. J. Gils (1995). Comparison of nonlocal approaches in continuum damage mechanics. *Computers and Structures* 55, 581–588.